

'It's like equality now; it's not as if it's the old days': an investigation into gender identity development and football participation of adolescent girls.

Journal:	<i>Soccer & Society</i>
Manuscript ID:	Draft
Manuscript Type:	Original Article
Keywords:	Gender, Girls, Football, Identity, Adolescence

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Review Only

1
2
3 **'It's like equality now; it's not as if it's the old days': an investigation**
4 **into gender identity development and football participation of**
5 **adolescent girls.**
6
7
8

9
10 Hanya Pielichaty

11
12 *College of Social Science, University of Lincoln, Lincoln, England*

13 College of Social Science

14 Business and Law Building

15 University of Lincoln

16 Brayford Pool

17 Lincoln

18 LN6 7TS.

19 United Kingdom

20
21 hpielichaty@lincoln.ac.uk

22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
01522 835695

Hanya joined the University of Lincoln in 2011 and her research interests stem from her own football career spanning 15 years and a fascination with gender identity and the socialisation processes involved in its development. Hanya Pielichaty is a lecturer in the Tourism and Events team at the University of Lincoln. After graduating in Psychology and Philosophy at the University of Warwick, she completed an MSc in Sport and Recreation Management at Sheffield. Hanya has practitioner experience with the Institute of Youth Sport, the Youth Sport Trust, and the Lincolnshire Sports Partnership.

1
2
3 **‘It’s like equality now; it’s not as if it’s the old days’: an investigation**
4 **into gender identity development and football participation of**
5 **adolescent girls.**
6
7
8
9

10 This article explores the influence participating in football has on the
11 development of adolescent girls’ gender identity, an area which currently lacks
12 academic attention. Data is taken from an ethnographic study with a group of
13 adolescent girls and boys and compared to Jeanes’¹ research. A social
14 constructionist framework was deployed with links to both critical theory and
15 feminist literature. Qualitative and participatory methods were used to fully
16 engage with the complex issue of gender identity. The girls within this study
17 were aware of the normative gender expectations linked to ‘being a female’ but
18 did not find this restrictive. The girls moved between many changing identities
19 and organised their ‘web of selves’² accordingly. The apparent need to measure
20 success by the parameters of male standards created a barrier to girls’ identity
21 development.
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

29
30 Keywords: gender; girls; football; identity; adolescence
31

32 This research explores the construction and development of gender identity in
33 adolescent girls who participate in football. In the past two decades there has been a
34 noticeable increase in the number of girls and women participating in football, which
35 now stands at 1.3million regular players³. The FA have recently introduced the 2013-
36 2018 strategy for women’s football in England entitled *Game Changer* which seeks to
37 consolidate and improve on the progression the women’s game has seemingly made so
38 far⁴. It is still questionable to what extent these positive changes are mirrored by
39 evolving cultural ideologies surrounding female football participation. This paper shall
40 address the on-going challenges faced by girls who play football and pose a ‘direct
41 threat to masculine identity’⁵ when they do so.
42
43
44
45
46
47
48

49 Caudwell⁶ suggests that even though there has been a publicly visible increased
50 involvement of females engaging with football, this remains to be ‘highly contingent on
51 gender’ and continues to be a male sport. This study considers the differences and
52 similarities between Jeanes’⁷ preadolescent girls’ perception and development of gender
53 identity compared to those adolescent girls in the current study. Unlike Jeanes’ research
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 boys have been used in the present study as femininities and masculinities cannot be
4 understood fully in isolation from one another⁸.
5
6

7 8 **A constructed female**

9
10 For the purpose of this research the term identity shall be likened to the concept of self-
11 understanding in order to avoid ambiguity surrounding the word⁹. Therefore,
12 constructing a female identity relates to understanding the self as a gendered being. Past
13 research claims that ‘the internal conviction regarding one’s gender classification – is
14 no longer positioned as a fixed essence at the core of a person’¹⁰. This definition shares
15 similarities with poststructuralists’ views on gender identity as being fluid, changing
16 and multiple¹¹, an important viewpoint for this article. This implies that gender identity
17 is no longer situated at the core of a person and instead lies beyond the core and is
18 influenced by social and cultural valuations of gender. Individuals are not ‘passive
19 dupes’ but rather active people creating their own gender within social systems¹².
20
21

22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
Cockburn¹³ suggests that there are two counter-posed concepts of female gender
identity those girls or women who adhere to ‘traditionally prescribed standards of
femininity’ and those opposed to the traditional, rigid societal assumptions of the typical
feminine identity. This first concept can be linked to the category of ‘girlie girl’ and the
second description links to the category of tomboy; concepts that have been used
frequently in past literature exploring girlhood¹⁴. The categories of both tomboy and
‘girlie girl’ can be seen as deviant identities¹⁵.

The girls in Jeanes’¹⁶ study initially felt that the deviant identities of ‘girly girl’
and tomboy were polar opposites; however, by using visual prompts such as magazines
and participatory activities, further discussion showed that the ‘girlie girl’/tomboy
dichotomy was not so clear-cut and the girls moved between a number of shifting
feminine identities. More recently Jeanes¹⁷ maintained that the girls’ ‘gender
performances were much more fluid and complex and involved drawing on multiple
positions in different contexts.’ Gender is confusing and the various barriers to
prescribing to typically ‘male’ or ‘female’ traits prevent individuals from seeing the
‘full range of diversity’ that exists¹⁸.

The social experiences of young people help to facilitate their own gender
identity development; experiences include playing football, attending school, making
friends, romance and family life. Connell¹⁹ provides support for the view that gender is

1
2
3 developed through social constructions in which children actively participate. Research
4 is available to support the notion that gender identity can shift in social situations and
5 they explore the transformation period of girls who move from aligning to a 'girly girl'
6 persona to that of tomboy in middle childhood²⁰.
7
8

9
10 Stereotypical gender expectations of girls consist of having to be feminine in
11 both appearance and character. Clayton and Harris²¹ suggest that traditionally feminine
12 women must be 'hetero-sexy', expressive and supportive, thereby taking on both a
13 feminine exterior and adopting typically caring feminine characteristics. Other
14 research²² studied the differing perceptions of masculine and feminine values that boys
15 and girls held in relation to various sports and appearance. They found that girls were
16 more conscious about their appearance than boys and rated being slender, attractive and
17 feminine as highly important.
18
19

20
21 Playing football is not a necessary component for girls' gender identity
22 development²³, whereas for boys, football is an integral part in forming a masculine
23 identity and becoming a 'real man'²⁴. Renold²⁵ elaborates on this to state that 'the sense
24 of hegemonic masculinity appeared to be constructed through the exclusion of female
25 participation in the game.' Other contemporary literature maintains that girls and boys
26 produce a 'gender performance' which aligns to a male standards and expectations
27 through participation in football²⁶.
28
29

30
31 Research suggests that female sports stars and athletes must negotiate their own
32 sense of femininity in a way which incorporates their sports participation. Shakib²⁷
33 claims that 'gender still seems to shape how 'female athlete' is constructed;' parallels
34 can be drawn between this and the concept of 'counter-identity' prevalent in
35 Mennesson's²⁸ work. More recent work draws on the paradox of being a football girl²⁹
36 which conceptualises the two opposing gender binaries clashing. The term counter-
37 identity is used to describe the situation of females who want to identify with both a
38 feminine self and that of sports participator. The present research investigates whether
39 the issue of counter-identities arise in adolescent girl's football.
40
41

42
43 Unlike other sports, when a girl plays football she poses a 'direct threat to
44 masculine identity'³⁰ which concerns many associated issues revolving around gender
45 clashes, the development of the girl's own identity and qualms over continued
46 participation. It is acknowledged that 'the female can function in "masculine"
47 manners... only with greater effort than is required for feminine operations'³¹. Recent
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 research by Eliasson³² supports ideas that girls must relate to a male standard that exists
4 in football. This implies that in order for a girl to pursue football, a sport which
5 contradicts traditional feminine values, she must work harder to reach success.
6
7

8 However, the girls in Jeanes'³³ study did not seem to have too many troubles
9 with balancing their playing with their chosen gender identity. The 'girlie girls' did not
10 find playing football inhibiting and their football identity was placed alongside their
11 other multiple identities in which they moved between. For the tomboy girls playing
12 football reinforced their chosen gender identity which involved disregarding the typical
13 normative mould of femininity. Concerns were raised by the girls about playing
14 football in the future as by that time gender would be 'no longer open for negotiation,'
15 as sacrifices for marriage and children would have to be made³⁴.
16
17
18
19
20
21

22 **The adolescent footballer**

23
24 The present study explores the football experiences of adolescent girls with the view to
25 understand how girls' experience of playing football develops as they get older. The
26 step into adolescence is a pivotal stage in development and 'characterised by heightened
27 social pressure to conform to gender expectations from peers and increased female
28 sports attrition'³⁵. Moving onto secondary school represents a child's transition through
29 to adolescence which can be known to temporarily disrupt a young person's
30 organisation of their self-concept³⁶. It can be suggested that these social transitions can
31 be disruptive to the child's on-going construction of gender identity development. The
32 move to secondary school is seen as a big social shift in a young person's life and has
33 an affect on their sports participation³⁷. Therefore adolescence can be perceived as a
34 time for identity organisation, whereby the individual attempts to string together many
35 varying personas of oneself in order to create a self-concept that they are comfortable
36 with.
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45

46 Some developmental psychologists, such as Erikson³⁸ would disagree with this
47 in favour of a more dogmatic view proposing that identity formation only occurs in
48 adolescence. However, other more recent academics³⁹ disagree and believe that
49 children continually strive to make sense of their own identities throughout their
50 childhood. Much feminist literature also alludes to the idea of gender as continually
51 shifting and changing in relation to social contexts and relations⁴⁰.
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Curry⁴¹ purports that,

‘adolescents have been found to maintain a ‘complex web of selves’ to help accommodate the complexities of modern living – with different ‘selves’ featuring in the family, at school or with friends.’

This view is consistent with the feminist poststructuralist position which provides a theoretical framework more sympathetic to social research of this type. This strand of feminism advocates ‘a shift away from a focus on a single material ‘reality’ to a position where there are many alternative versions or constructions of reality’⁴². This is in keeping with the adolescent’s ‘complex web of selves’ in which there are many versions of the self that the individual may wish to promote.

Boys, masculinity and football

Swain⁴³ observed playground behaviour of schoolboys and depicted that school playgrounds were industrious masculinity making machines which taught boys to become men. Football was integral to this teaching and the girls within his observations were marginalised and pushed aside in order to make way for boy’s football. This research epitomises the reasons as to why girls do feel separated from the game of football; unlike boys they do not feel that they must play football in order to be ‘female’.

The girls in Swain’s study complained that the boys ‘wouldn’t let us’ play and ‘they kept shouting at us and saying go away!’⁴⁴ The girls were viewed as disrupting the game in the playground and not taking it seriously enough and were therefore excluded from participation. Girls who tried to join in with boy’s football complained of not being passed to which further demonstrates the dominance of power that football attributes to males⁴⁵. Some girls felt that men would not accept them as valid housewives in the future if they continued to play football⁴⁶. These girls believed that boys would prefer to fancy a ‘girlie girl’ and implied that boys would not eventually want to marry a tomboy girl. The issues of masculinity, femininity and football will be discussed with the boys in this article.

Theoretical underpinning

The different epistemological paradigms relevant to this study are that of constructionism and critical theory. Constructionism is a social approach to knowledge which purports that 'experience should be understood through the individuals living it'⁴⁷. Whereas, critical theory refers to knowledge and experience through the different power relations prevalent in society. Feminist research and information from childhood studies was also used to guide the present research methodology.

The social constructionist approach to identity is in keeping with feminist poststructuralists' views concerning gender identity development and the multiple identities that can operate simultaneously in each individual. Using feminist poststructuralist analysis for this article enables positions of participants to be continually constructed and reconstructed. An ethnographic approach to data collected was adopted which is considered an appropriate style of research to use in childhood studies. The researcher helped to run the girl's football training and then the research sessions were carried out in school lunch breaks.

Methods and data collection

Data was collected from a comprehensive school in the East Midlands, which was attended by both males and females between the ages of 11 and 18 years old and is open to children from all kinds of demographics. This school varies to the private institute that Jeanes⁴⁸ used in her study, but similarly, this study used a non-probability sampling system where participants were deliberately chosen to fit a certain research profile. The profile was for a female (or male for the other group); aged between 11 and 15 years old who attended the school and would be taking part in the district football competition. Within this study, 19 girls and seven boys participated, all of who were white and British in origin. All 19 girls participated in some observation sessions, however only 11 participated in the focus groups and interviews. The boys group were not part of the district competition but were all avid football players.

A mixed method approach was taken to allow the girls freedom to express their identities; which included semi-structured interviews, focus groups, observations and participatory activities. Qualitative methods such as focus groups, interviews,

1
2
3 observations and photographic imagery were used within this research as they are more
4 suitable to provide the in-depth information necessary for a study of this nature.

5
6 Group interaction that occurred within the focus groups and interviews provided
7 insights into experiences of the participants that would have otherwise been
8 inaccessible. This is particularly useful when combined with feminist theory as this
9 type of qualitative research allows women's voices to be vocalised⁴⁹. Focus groups are a
10 common research method and were selected purposely to allow adolescent girls to feel
11 comfortable to participate⁵⁰. The focus groups were held in friendship groups as
12 suggested by Jeanes⁵¹ to ensure that all participants felt secure enough to voice their
13 opinions in a safe environment.

14
15 The girls' views of gender and football were investigated using visual prompts
16 such as newspapers and magazines to facilitate discussion about what was seen. Moss⁵²
17 et al also advocates the use of "visual narratives" in research and believes that they are
18 'important sources of knowing that can contribute to the interpretation and re-
19 interpretation of diverse cultures.' This type of methodology, which is driven by the
20 social contexts of the participant combined with the integration of reflexive tools, is
21 important to the present research.

22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 **Results and discussion**

34
35
36 The topic of girls and femininity in the twenty-first century is a complex and layered
37 matter, which involves the unravelling and re-furnishing of old-fashioned gender
38 dichotomies. The girls in this study were all astute, self-aware and assertive individuals
39 who all showed clear knowledge of gender divides.

40
41
42 When asked to describe themselves the girls used words such as sporty, arty,
43 girlie, fun, competitive, loud, friendly and intelligent. This overview of personality
44 traits shows that these girls adopt characteristics from either end of the
45 feminine/masculine dichotomy which is in-keeping with earlier work⁵³. The girlie, arty
46 and friendly characteristics could be argued to subscribe to the traditionally feminine
47 model of 'hetero-sexy' outlined by Clayton and Harris⁵⁴. Whereas self descriptions such
48 as competitive, sporty and loud relate to a more masculine persona, making a shift away
49 from typically feminine qualities.

1
2
3 However, the girls in this research were still aware of the stereotypical views
4 about femininity and masculinity in which previous research acknowledges⁵⁵. Jeanes⁵⁶
5 study refers to the 'girlie girl' character, which possesses the ultimate features of
6 femininity through both appearance and attitude. Whereas the girls in this study take
7 'girlie girls' to be synonymous with the term 'plastics' a phrase lifted from the teenage
8 film *Mean Girls*.
9
10
11
12

13
14 **Researcher:** Plastics? Is that another 'type' you have at school?

15 **Hayley:** Yeah. Wear loads of make-up and they change their voices to sound really
16 high pitched all the time.

17 **Researcher:** They have high pitched voices?

18 **Hayley:** Well they change them all the time. Like at home they will talk to their parents
19 just how we're talking to you now but at school they're like 'yeah it's all right'
20 (mimicking high pitched voice) and everything like that.

21 **Hayley:** Like Barbie. They can be like quite smart sometimes, but they just act stupid.
22
23

24 As shown above, extreme values of femininity are conveyed as being 'plastic' in both
25 name and nature. The girls all agreed that this extreme type of girl does exist but not
26 amongst themselves, all girls felt that they were 'in the middle' of the masculine/
27 feminine continuum. However, the girls did refer to other peers they knew who would
28 be too self-conscious of their feminine appearance to play football.
29
30
31

32 During the semi-structured interviews girls were asked to bring in pictures of
33 themselves it was found that *gender appropriate* photographs showed the girls in the
34 colour pink, wearing dresses or going shopping. These are discourses which can be
35 associated with stereotypical views of gender and therefore support the pre-conceptions
36 of femininity⁵⁷.
37
38
39

40 However, photographs chosen to convey *gender inappropriate* behaviour and
41 appearance showed girls receiving football awards, wearing oversized t-shirts and
42 competing in sporting events. This is interesting as the girls believed that achieving
43 success in sports and being active were associated with being more masculine; a view
44 also supported by stereotypical notions of gender.
45
46
47
48

49 The girls thought that being a 'girlie girl' or a 'plastic' was solely about
50 appearance and façade. Whereas being a tomboy was not just about the perceived
51 exterior but also involved the girls behaving in a certain way and adopting a specific
52 personality. However, the girls in this research demonstrate that the feminine and
53 masculine divides are not clear-cut. For example, one photograph shown was described
54 by Jane as adhering to masculine traits because she was pictured playing a sport and
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 wearing baggy clothes. Whereas Simone and Claire felt that the image related to more
4 feminine dispositions due to Jane's pink top in the photograph and the way she wore her
5 hair.
6
7

8 Similarly to Jeanes⁵⁸ findings the girls in this study were knowledgeable of the
9 different 'types' of girl and were competent when asked to recite their related traits. It
10 may also highlight her findings whereby femininity is described as diverse but still
11 limited in how it is adopted. All girls felt that they related to many different traits
12 which are drawn from both the typically feminine and masculine pool of characteristics.
13
14
15
16

17 ***Participation and power***

18
19 Through football practice and tournament observations there was much evidence in
20 support of an increased amount of participation in girl's football. When the girls were
21 asked why they liked playing football they said that it was relaxing, energetic, a chance
22 to tackle people and *take your anger out* on something. However, in accordance with
23 Jeanes⁵⁹ findings, all the girls in this research also realised that the men held all the
24 power in football.
25
26
27
28

29 Swain's⁶⁰ research concerning hegemonic masculinities portrayed that playing
30 football helps to sculpt a boy's gender identity construction. Whereas the findings of
31 this study show that football is not a necessary component of identity development for
32 girls and the essence of femininity does not stem from playing alone. However, the
33 girls in this research all used football as an instrument to help them create one of their
34 many changing identities.
35
36
37
38

39 These adolescent girls are self-assured and play football because they can and
40 are confident in their own abilities. Hayley epitomises this view,
41
42
43

44 'When I go out and play with the boys they are like "oh no we don't want you to play,"
45 but once you go and play they pass to us. They sometimes are just joking, but then you
46 think, well we're good enough to play, otherwise we wouldn't be playing.'
47
48

49 The girls in this study know that they are 'good enough to play' as well as being good
50 enough to play netball, basketball, go shopping, take dance lessons and go to school
51 discos. This is important as it defies the research by Swain⁶¹ which does not consider
52 gender restrictions to be dissolved through mere competency levels. It seems that the
53 girls in this research can enter into masculine dominated realms if their playing abilities
54 are 'good enough.'
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 The girls in this study see playing football as a platform which they can use in
4 order to prove to others that they can play football of a high quality. Throughout the
5 research process the girls refer to wanting to prove themselves to the *lads* and be
6 accepted as good players. Samantha at one stage in the research was upset after losing
7 some matches in the football tournament and tells the researcher that ‘the lads are going
8 to laugh at us, they always do.’ Therefore, a big concern of the girls playing football is
9 how they will be perceived by the boys.
10

11
12 This need for reassurance links to the girls’ desires to relate to typical notions of
13 femininity in which they seek male approval. Therefore playing football for the girls is
14 not an activity that can be performed in total isolation from stereotypical gender beliefs.
15 This may influence future participation rates in two ways. Firstly, girls may cease from
16 playing due to failing to prove themselves successfully to the boys and not being able to
17 endure more taunting. Or, girls may continue to participate in order to prove the boys
18 wrong by striving to reach success.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

27 28 **‘Web of Selves’**

29 The girls in this research have all been affected by their surroundings at the local level.
30 Claire noted that moving to secondary school was ‘a massive change’ which brought
31 with it new friends, more homework and hard lessons. Constructing a feminine identity
32 for the girls can be viewed as being a social task performed unaware at home, in school
33 and out with friends. The girls show evidence of having to negotiate their own sense of
34 femininity in a way which incorporates their sports participation. Although, negotiation
35 here is not a negative manoeuvre involving limitations and restrictions. Negotiation for
36 these girls merely means to rearrange their ever-shifting identities around playing
37 football.
38
39
40
41
42
43

44 Mennesson⁶² assumes that female sports players will experience a counter-
45 identity, whereby the girls must compromise between being both a women and a sports
46 participator. However, a counter-identity implies the presence of two identities
47 antagonising with one another, a description which is not relevant to the girls in this
48 research. Not at any point in the research did the girls imply that they have concerns
49 with being both a female and an athlete, a finding which also contrasts to Jeanes⁶³
50 research which views football and femininity as being ‘competing discourses.’
51
52
53
54
55
56
57

58 **Researcher:** Is there anything in which it is not known for a girl to do?
59
60

1
2
3 **Kate:** Not really

4 **Researcher:** So you think girls now will not get judged for doing anything?

5 **Hayley:** Well they may judge you, but they might not tell you openly about it.

6 **Researcher:** So you think that judging goes on still but now it is more discrete?

7 **Hayley:** Because now they know it is equal, it's like equality now; it's not as if it's the
8 old days now.
9

10
11 Hayley refers to equality and having more freedom to choose what she does and who
12 she does it with. Kate supports this notion and believes that twentieth century girls are
13 not restricted by social barriers as severely as they once were. This exchange conveys
14 that the girls have no qualms with being both a female and an athlete. The equal society
15 in which they believe they are part of does not wish to constrict these girls from having
16 both of these identities. In this research the two personas of female and footballer are
17 not *counter-identities* but rather *transferable identities* which change and adapt to every
18 situation.
19

20
21 In keeping with Nash⁶⁴ this research finds that it is harder for the girls to play
22 football than boys as they have to challenge the dominant normative gender
23 expectations placed upon them. Both practical and sociological restrictions burden the
24 girls and make it more difficult for them to compete in the sport. Sociological
25 restrictions include the rigid views held by both the boys and girls that play about girl's
26 football. Girls describe boys as excluding them in some instances from the game and
27 by 'showing off' in their presence.
28

29
30 However, these adolescent girls did not find it difficult to add football to their
31 current *web of selves*⁶⁵. Identities are not seen as fixed for the girls, Claire says that
32 'when I want to be I can be girlie, but when I want to be I can be a tomboy as well.'
33 Therefore the rigid 'types' of girls shown in the media are not accurate portrayals of
34 girls' real identities. Hayley states that 'I don't really have a type, we're all just our
35 own people, and we all do what we want to do and not to please anybody else.' All the
36 girls in this research felt that they could shift between many changing identities;
37 showing that even though they are affected by certain constraints they also experience a
38 great deal of opportunity and freedom through their multiple identities.
39

40
41 The majority of girls in this research describe themselves as being 'in the
42 middle' of the rigid 'girlie girl'/tomboy dichotomy. However, a better description for
43 the dichotomy could be a multi-faceted paradigm as all girls agreed that they have many
44 identity options available to them which they can move fluidly between. For these girls
45 playing football was seen as an added bonus to the other activities and events that
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 occurred in their everyday lives. Playing football did not threaten their gender
4 identities, but in fact accompanied their many other identities which they flittered
5 between.
6
7

8 Jane described herself as a tomboy and she took football more seriously than the
9 rest of the girls in the research. She is a member of a football club outside of school and
10 football was an activity for her which dominated other sports in her life. Her chosen
11 gender identity, similarly to the tomboys in Jeanes'⁶⁶ study, was reinforced and
12 complimented by her playing football. However, Jane engaged with the other girls
13 about music and other discussion topics and enjoyed going to the school disco also. It
14 can be depicted that Jane's football identity is a large part of her life but not the only
15 part, leaving enough space to incorporate her other identities.
16
17
18
19
20

21 The girls in this research all believed that they would continue to play football in
22 the future. However, further discussions lead to findings about future limitations.
23
24
25

26 **Researcher:** What problems, if any, do you think may arise if you wanted to carry on
27 playing football in the future?

28 **Beverly:** We probably wouldn't get boyfriends and we probably wouldn't get picked to
29 join a team because I don't know any adult teams.

30 **Researcher:** Why do you think you wouldn't get a boyfriend?

31 **Beverly:** Because boys aren't interested in girls that like to play men's sports.

32 **Claire:** I think they are.

33 **Hannah:** Also, because boys don't like it when you're better than them.
34
35

36 Beverly, Claire and Hannah are young girls from the sample group and express varying
37 opinions. Claire's views compliment the views of the older girls mentioned later in the
38 dissertation all of which are optimistic about relationships coinciding with football
39 playing. Whereas Beverly and Hannah's opinions are similar to the girls in Jeanes'⁶⁷
40 study who believed that playing football will be problematic in adult life. It is
41 interesting that the girls all still want to play in the future despite acknowledging
42 possible problems in terms of opportunity to play and relationship troubles. It can be
43 suggested that these girls are all willing to maintain their fluid identities in the future,
44 sliding between playing football, being a mother and wife and a career women.
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Adolescence

The younger girls in this study were 11 and 12 years old and the majority of them held similar opinions to girls in previous research⁶⁸. Whereas, the older girls aged between 13 and 15 years held more considered and mature opinions on the topics of femininity and football. It does seem that these girls experienced a great deal of continuous *identity organisation* in which they attempt to structure their many changing personas which they adopt. Beverly is an extremely sporty girl and plays football alongside many other activities, although she struggled to balance her sport playing with homework. It seems that increased opportunity for school sports participation ties in with increased levels of responsibility to maintain high grades. Alongside making new friends and sustaining a happy family life, adolescents who are both sporty and academic do have many *selves* to organise.

The *complex web of selves*⁶⁹ has much relevance to these findings. The girls had an after-school football tournament in which they played for two hours; however their evenings did not end immediately after. One girl had netball training after the tournament and the rest of the girls had a school disco to attend. This is interesting as football during adolescence appears to be another activity to be part of, sitting alongside school dances and other sports. This finding is similar to Jeanes⁷⁰ work in which girls did not prioritise football above all other activities. The complex web of multiple identities that these girls weave is mirrored by the increased opportunities available to them since growing older.

The girls in Jeanes⁷¹ research all state that they will not carry on playing football in the future as continual participation may jeopardise their chances of marriage and relationships. However the majority of girls in this research saw no problems with carrying on playing football in the future. A reason for this may be because all the girls in this study have been playing football for many years and were in a team prior to the research being held. Whereas the girls in Jeanes' study were asked to join football training to form part of the study; this may have effected the girls' commitment and dedication to the sport.

Researcher: Do you think playing football in the future will affect your chances of having relationships or getting married?

Kate: It won't affect our chances because they might like football.

Charlotte: Yeah, but it's manly; they might think you're like a man.

1
2
3 **Hope:** If you have something in common to talk about and play and you can have a kick
4 about in your back garden. You've got something in common.

5 **Hayley:** I think the men would appreciate it if they could sit down with their wives or
6 girlfriends and watch the game together and discuss it together.
7

8
9 Charlotte and Hope are the youngest girls in the above discussion, but both held
10 different opinions about the issue. It seems that Charlotte's thoughts were similar to the
11 girls in Jeanes' research, whereas Hope's opinions were more in line with those of the
12 older girls in the discussion. Therefore identity development can be seen as being an
13 individual, personal and unique process which is not wholly dependent upon age.
14
15
16

17 18 19 **The boys**

20 Overall, the boys in this study conveyed sincere support for females to play football but
21 believed that the gender separation of the game should continue in schools.
22

23 Furthermore, boys' and girls' opinions differ on many issues and occasionally
24 stereotypical beliefs held by the girls cloud the reality of the situation.
25

26
27 These findings support previous research findings⁷² which proposed that females
28 are marginalised and discounted from the game of football due to their gender. Some of
29 the girls in this study have experienced a great deal of animosity when wanting to play
30 football with the boys, Jane said that she enjoys playing with the boys but 'they got all
31 angry and wouldn't let me play.' Kate suggested a reason for this could be because
32 'they think they're the best and they're not.' These reflections of inequality on the
33 football pitch reinforce Swain's idea that the school playground is an arena promoting
34 notions of hegemonic masculinities.
35
36
37
38
39

40 However, the girls in this research believed that boys excluded them from the
41 game because of biased opinions and physical power. Charlotte stated that 'they are
42 bigger and think they can rule,' and the boys also looked upon their physicality as the
43 main isolating factor for the gender divide.
44
45
46
47
48

49 **Researcher:** Do you think football is a sport that girls and boys can play equally?

50 **Steve:** Boys with boys, and girls with girls but not mixed up.

51 **Researcher:** Why not?

52 **Steve:** I think more arguments happen when it's like that.

53 **Vince:** I think it's because of the physical side.

54 **Researcher:** Because females are not as physically strong?

55 **Vince:** No, I think some are but sometimes boys are a bit more physical and go in
56 harder.

57 **Steve:** Some girls are actually quite good at football.
58
59
60

1
2
3 **Vince:** Some girls are better than boys but I'm just saying about the physical side.
4

5 Here, the boys recognise that some girls are competent football players, but the boys
6 themselves feel that they cannot play to their most physical level when playing with or
7 against females. This is contradictory to the girls who note that 'you can tackle people'
8 as one of the best things about playing the sport. In keeping with this Hayley, a
9 competent player, attacks the boys' views,
10
11

12
13
14
15 'If they're playing against you and treat you differently, like they don't go in and tackle
16 you or anything, then you feel like, I've not come here just to play and look good in
17 front of all you boys, I've come to play football.'
18

19
20 It seems that when the boys did not tackle the girls and avoided using strength against
21 them the girls found this insulting. The girls want to be taken seriously when playing
22 and treated equally and therefore tackling and physical strength would be part of that.
23 However, the boys do not want to go in too strongly or be overtly physical with the
24 females because it seems like an *unnatural* prospect for them to do so. Playing football
25 beside and against females involves accepting the female as a team mate, comrade and
26 opponent. Accepting the female as a comrade on the pitch involves allowing that
27 female to step over the invisible barrier of patriarchal hegemony which restricts the
28 male's actions as much as the female's.
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36

37 **Concluding remarks**

38
39 The relationship between boys, girls and football is an intricate one. The present
40 research has established that both girls and boys are constrained to some extent by
41 persistent gender stereotypes. These gender stereotypes are important markers for the
42 way in which girls and boys judge their own participation in football and the opposite
43 gender's participation alike. However, freedom also appears in the girls' experiences
44 through their ability to shift from one desirable identity to the next.
45
46
47
48

49 Unlike other research the girls' identities in this article of being both footballer
50 and female did not antagonise one another, rather they sat happily next to each other,
51 amongst their other identities. The adolescent girls in this study were more comfortable
52 with the idea of playing football in the future. It is possible that the adolescent girls
53 were more competent in *organising* their *web of selves* so that the competing discourses
54 of potential wife and footballer did not interfere.
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 This research acknowledges that the young girls do have greater opportunity to
4 negotiate their identities through football but similarly to Jeanes⁷³ it is noted that
5 'participating in football did not provide the girls involved in the research with a space
6 to resist dominant gender norms.'
7
8

9
10 The game of football is typically associated with male dominance, masculine
11 pride and competitive spirit. Whereas the new found popularity of the female game
12 looks to assert women's football as being of equal importance and worth as the men's
13 game. The girls in this study show feisty ambition and want to continue to play football
14 even though they are aware of the lack of power females hold in the game. However,
15 they also continually seek male attention, approval and support. Beverly announced the
16 possible benefits of being a professional football would be to 'show the lads.'
17
18 Throughout this research the girls continuously reverted back to wanting to prove
19 themselves to the boys and show that they were talented players. This need to reach
20 masculine standards will only hinder the future growth of the women's game; female
21 players should aspire to only reach their own targets.
22
23

24
25 This research has brought together many key issues concerning girl's football,
26 gender identity and the future of the sport. The girls in this study were aware that
27 dominant normative gender expectations affect them in everyday life. However, their
28 awareness of this issue did not entirely restrict them in any way; they continued to reach
29 out to both feminine and masculine traits associated with the supposed gender binary.
30
31 The girls moved between many changing identities which continually adapted and
32 changed depending on the social stimuli present. Some of these different identities
33 could be viewed as being competing; however the way in which the girls *organised*
34 their identities ensured that a balance could be kept between them all.
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Notes

1. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'; Jeanes, "I'm into heels and make up".
2. Curry, 'Adolescence'.
3. Football Association, 'Women and Girls',
<http://www.thefa.com/GetIntoFootball/Players/PlayersPages/WomensAndGirls>.
4. Football Association, 'Game Changer'.
5. Mean, 'Identity and discursive practice: doing gender on the football pitch'.
6. Caudwell, 'Reviewing UK Football Culture', 323.
7. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'; Jeanes, "I'm into heels and make up".
8. Reay, "Spice Girls".
9. Cooper, *Colonialism in Question: Theory, Knowledge, History*.
10. Corbett, *Boyhoods: Rethinking Masculinities*, 95.
11. Butler, *Bodies that Matter*.
12. Messner, *It's all for the Kids*, 22.
13. Cockburn, 'Identities and Subculture in Relation to Sport', 137.
14. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
15. Thorne, *Gender Play*.
16. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
17. Jeanes, "I'm into heels and make up", 409.
18. Reay, "Spice Girls" 163.
19. Connell, *Gender*.
20. Halim et al., 'From Pink Frilly Dresses to "One of the Boys"'.
21. Clayton and Harris, 'Footballers' Wives'.
22. Klomstom et al., 'Adolescents' Perceptions of Masculine and Feminine Values in Sport and Physical Education'.

-
- 1
2
3
4
5 23. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'; Jeanes, "I'm into heels and
6 make up".
7
8
9 24. Swain, "The Money's Good, the Fame's Good, the Girls' are Good".
10
11 25. Renold, "All They've Got on Their Brains is Football", 8.
12
13 26. Eliasson, 'Gendered Socialization'.
14
15 27. Shakib, 'Female Basketball Participation', 1408.
16
17 28. Mennesson, "Hard" Women and "Soft" Women'.
18
19 29. Eliasson, 'Gendered Socialization'.
20
21 30. Mean, 'Identity and Discursive Practice', 789.
22
23 31. Nash, 'Developmental Psychology', 371.
24
25 32. Eliasson, 'Gendered Socialization'.
26
27 33. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'; Jeanes, "I'm into heels and
28 make up".
29
30
31 34. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity', 92.
32
33 35. Shakib, 'Female Basketball Participation', 1405.
34
35 36. Materska et al., Les Desorganisations'.
36
37 37. Clark, 'Being "Good at Sport"'.
38
39 38. Erikson, *Identity: Youth and Crisis*.
40
41 39. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
42
43 40. Butler, *Gender Trouble*.
44
45 41. Curry, 'Adolescence', 109.
46
47 42. Percy, 'Feminism', 33.
48
49 43. Swain, "The Money's Good, the Fame's Good, the Girls' are Good".
50
51 44. Swain, "The Money's Good, the Fame's Good, the Girls' are Good", 104.
52
53 45. Renold, "All They've Got on Their Brains is Football".
54
55 46. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
56
57
58
59
60

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5 47. Jeanes, *Tackling Gender: Girls, Football and Identity Construction*, 74.
- 6
- 7 48. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
- 8
- 9 49. Flick, *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*.
- 10
- 11 50. Culp, 'Adolescent Girls and Outdoor Recreation'.
- 12
- 13 51. Jeanes, *Tackling Gender: Girls, Football and Identity Construction*.
- 14
- 15 52. Moss et al., 'Student Researchers in the Middle', 51.
- 16
- 17 53. Harris and Butterworth, *Developmental Psychology*.
- 18
- 19 54. Clayton and Harris, 'Footballers' Wives'.
- 20
- 21 55. Jeanes, "'I'm into heels and make up'".
- 22
- 23 56. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
- 24
- 25 57. Clayton and Harris, 'Footballers' Wives'.
- 26
- 27 58. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
- 28
- 29 59. Jeanes, "'I'm into heels and make up'".
- 30
- 31 60. Swain, "'The Money's Good, the Fame's Good, the Girls' are Good'".
- 32
- 33 61. Swain, "'The Money's Good, the Fame's Good, the Girls' are Good'".
- 34
- 35 62. Mennesson, "'Hard' Women and 'Soft' Women'.
- 36
- 37 63. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity', 77.
- 38
- 39 64. Nash, 'Developmental Psychology'.
- 40
- 41 65. Curry, 'Adolescence'.
- 42
- 43 66. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
- 44
- 45 67. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
- 46
- 47 68. Jeanes, "'I'm into heels and make up'".
- 48
- 49 69. Curry, 'Adolescence'.
- 50
- 51 70. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'.
- 52
- 53 71. Jeanes, 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'; Jeanes, "'I'm into heels and
- 54
- 55
- 56 make up'".
- 57
- 58
- 59
- 60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

72. Swain, “The Money’s Good, the Fame’s Good, the Girls’ are Good”; Renold, “All They’ve Got on Their Brains is Football”.

73. Jeanes, “I’m into heels and make up”, 415.

For Peer Review Only

References

Butler, Judith. *Gender trouble*. Oxon: Routledge, 1990.

Butler, Judith. *Bodies that matter: on the discursive limits of 'sex'*. London: Routledge, 1993.

Caudwell, Jayne. 'Reviewing UK Football Cultures: Continuing with Gender Analyses'. *Soccer and Society* 12, no. 3 (2011): 323-329.

Clayton, Ben, and John Harris. 'Footballers' Wives: The Role of the Soccer Player's Partner in the Construction of Idealized Masculinity'. *Soccer and Society* 5, no. 3 (2004): 317-335.

Clark, Sheryl. 'Being "Good at Sport": Talent, Ability and Young Women's Sporting Participation'. *Sociology* 0, no. 0 (2012): 1-16.

Cockburn, Claudia. 'Identities and Subculture in Relation to Sport: An Analysis of Teenage Girls' Magazines.' In *Just Leisure: Equity, Social Exclusion and Identity*, ed. C. Brackenridge, D. Howe and F. Jordan, 131-148. Eastbourne: LSA, 2000.

Cooper, Frederick. *Colonialism in Question: theory, knowledge, history*. London: University of California Press, 2005.

Corbett, Ken. *Boyhoods: rethinking masculinities*. London: Yale University Press, 2009.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Connell, Raewyn W. *Gender*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2002.

Culp, Rocklynn H. 'Adolescent Girls and Outdoor Recreation: A Case Study Examining Constraints and Effective Programming. *Journal of Leisure Research* 30, no. 3 (1998): 356-379.

Curry, Carol. 'Adolescence'. In *Gender and Psychology*, ed. K.Trew and J.Kremer. L, 107-113. London: Arnold, 1998.

Durkin, Kevin. *Developmental Social Psychology: From Infancy to Old Age*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995.

Eliasson, Inger. (2011) 'Gendered Socialization Among Girls and Boys in Children's Football Teams in Sweden'. *Soccer and Society* 12, no. 6 (2011): 820-833.

Erikson, Erik.H. *Identity: Youth and Crisis*. London: Faber & Faber, 1968.

Flick, Uwe. *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. 3rd ed. London: Sage Publications, 2006.

Football Association. *Game Changer: The FA Plan for Women's Football in England 2013-18*. London: FA, 2012.

Football Association. 'Women's and Girls'.
<http://www.thefa.com/GetIntoFootball/Players/PlayersPages/WomensAndGirls>
(accessed 31 May, 2012).

Halim, May L, Diane N. Ruble, and David M. Amodio . 'From Pink Frilly Dresses to "One of the Boys": A Social Cognitive Analysis of Gender Identity

1
2
3
4
5 Development and Gender Bias'. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 5,
6 no. 11 (2011): 933-949.
7
8
9

10
11 Harris, John. 'Lie back and think of England: The women of Euro 96'. *Journal of Sport*
12 *and Social Issues* 23, no. 1 (1999): 96-110.
13
14

15
16 Harris, Margaret. and George Butterworth. *Developmental Psychology: A Student's*
17 *Handbook*. East Sussex: Psychology Press Ltd, 2002.
18
19

20
21 Jeanes, Ruth. 'Girls, Football Participation and Gender Identity'. In *Sport, Active*
22 *Leisure and Youth Cultures*, ed. P. Bramham and J. Caudwell. Eastbourne:
23 LSA, 2005.
24
25

26
27
28 Jeanes, Ruth. *Tackling Gender: Girls, Football and Identity Construction*. University of
29 Loughborough, 2006.
30
31

32
33 Jeanes, Ruth. "'I'm into high heels and make up but I still love football": exploring
34 identity and football participation with preadolescent girls'. *Soccer and Society*
35 12, no. 2 (2011): 402-420.
36
37
38

39
40
41
42 Klomsten, Anne T., Herbert W. Marsh, and Einar M. Skaalvik. 'Adolescents'
43 Perceptions of Masculine and Feminine Values in Sport and Physical Education:
44 A Study of Gender Differences'. *Sex Roles* 52, no. 9/10 (2005): 625-636.
45
46
47

48
49 Materska, Maria., Marie-Hélène. Garot, and Stéphane Ehrlich. 'Les Desorganisations de
50 la Representation de soi á l'entrée au College'. *European Journal of Psychology*
51 *of Education* 1, no. 4 (1987): 61-77.
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

- 1
2
3
4
5 Mean, Lindsey. 'Identity and discursive practice: doing gender on the football pitch'.
6 *Discourse and Society* 12, no. 6 (2001): 789-815.
7
8
9
- 10 Mennesson, Christine. "'Hard' Women and 'Soft' Women: The Social Construction of
11 Identities among Female Boxers'. *International Review for the Sociology of*
12 *Sport* 35, no. 1 (2000): 21-33.
13
14
15
- 16 Messner, Michael A. *It's all for the Kids: Gender, Families and Youth Sports*. London:
17 University of California Press, 2009.
18
19
20
- 21 Moss, Julianne, Joanne, Deppeler, Lesley Astley, and Kevin Pattison. 'Student
22 Researchers in the Middle: Using Visual Images to Make Sense of Inclusion
23 Education'. *Journal of Research in Special Education Needs* 7, no. 1 (2007): 46-
24 54.
25
26
27
28
29
- 30 Nash, John. *Developmental Psychology: A Psychobiological Approach*. 2nd ed.
31 Englewood-Cliffs: Prentice Hall Inc, 1978.
32
33
34
- 35 Percy, Carol. 'Feminism'. In *Gender and Psychology*, ed. K.Trew and J.Kremer. L,
36 27-40. London: Arnold, 1998.
37
38
39
40
41
- 42 Reay, Diane. "'Spice Girls,' 'Nice Girls', 'Girlyies', and 'Tomboys': Gender
43 Discourses, Girls' Cultures and Femininities in the Primary Classroom'. *Gender*
44 *and Education* 13, no. 2 (2001): 153-166.
45
46
47
- 48 Renold, Emma. "'All They've Got on Their Brains is Football': Sport, Masculinities
49 and the Gendered Practices of Playground Relations'. *Sport, Education and*
50 *Society* 2, no. 1 (1997): 5-23.
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5 Shakib, Sohaila. 'Female Basketball Participation: Negotiating the Conflation of Peer
6 Status and Gender Status from Childhood through Puberty'. *American*
7 *Behavioral Scientist* 46, no. 10 (2003): 1405-1422.
8
9

10
11 Schmalz, Dorothy.L, and Deborah Kerstetter. 'Girlie Girls and Manly Men: Children's
12 Stigma Consciousness of Gender in Sports and Physical Activities'. *Journal of*
13 *Leisure Research* 38, no. 4 (2006): 536-557.
14
15
16
17

18 Swain, Jon. "'The Money's Good, the Fame's Good, the Girls' are Good": The Role of
19 Playground Football in the Construction of Young Boys' Masculinity in Junior
20 School'. *British Journal of Sociology of Sport* 21, no. 1 (2000): 95-109.
21
22
23
24

25 Thorne, Barrie. *Gender Play: Girls and Boys in School*. Buckingham: Open University
26 Press, 1993.
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60