Professor Angela Thody of Lincoln University runs a series of day classes for postgraduate supervisors on the Supervisory relationship and on examining doctoral Theses. The lecture following is about how to manage postgraduate students. She also lectures to postgraduate students on how to manage your supervisor. For more information about the author or to book her to lecture
www.angelathody.com
Professor Angela Thody, Centre for Education Research and Development
University of Lincoln, Brayford Campus, Lincoln, LN6 7TS
Phone: 01522 886071
Email: athody@lincoln.ac.uk/angelathody450@hotmail.com
Keywords: post-graduate; supervision; university; research; doctoral; theses
Doctoral supervision has been my most fun relationship in teaching. It’s great being able to adjust so accurately to student needs and see an individual change before your very eyes. I’ve had the joy of working in my specialist areas (or at least closer to it than in most lectures or marking). I’ve felt that I’m helping to develop new ideas or seeing my own research project come to life. Supervision sessions give me the buzz of operating as an academic with an academic. It’s intense learning. And it ends with a recognisable and permanent product – one thesis (Thody, 2007, unpublished musings).
What did you learn about starting supervision sessions from the opening examples?

Provoking

Welcoming

Understanding what’s going to happen

Furniture dynamics

Making them feel secure
RESEARCH SUPERVISION: Today’s topics
Your role options
Co-creating the supervisory role with your student
Co-creating the thesis
Co-creating publications

Records of today’s session…?
What YOU want to learn: make your own notes

Power point slides: WILL BE ON THE VIRTUAL CAMPUS
Summary and references: hand out at the end of the day
RESEARCH SUPERVISION

YOUR ROLE OPTIONS

Try the quiz...
Research Supervision
ANGELA THODY    SUPERVISION MODELS

TECHNICAL RATIONALITY – STRUCTURALIST MODERNIST
Traditional liberal/humanist

The relationship is
• rational and transparent practice between autonomous individuals; assumed by both supervisor and student.
• not personal
• master-apprentice
• institutionalised – see University Code of Practice
• based on your authority as the university recognises your expertise

The aims are to
• develop student’s potential
• facilitate student independence
• train student in research practices
• socialise the student into the discipline
• guide student to resources
Research Supervision

SUPERVISION MODELS

EMOTIONAL - post modernist, individualistic
The relationship is

• unstated/unconscious/not anticipated by the student
• personal friendship
• some form of partnership/equality
• referred to in Codes of Practice as something to be avoided/controlled
• based on your friendliness and extent of social contact

The aims are

✓ joint development
✓ interdependence
✓ walk with the student on a journey
✓ varying according to the emotion: desire to please, to challenge, to demonstrate independence, to resist independence, to be respected as clever, to be liked, to be authoritative, to be powerful
Research Supervision
ANGELA THODY SUPERVISION MODELS

EROTIC – pre-modernist
The relationship is
• unstated, unconscious/conscious, not anticipated by student or supervisor
• very personal, close friendship
• close, possibly inequitable partnership
• not in Codes of Practice
• based on your intellectual attractiveness

The aims are
✓ an intense 1-1 relationship with someone who can discuss your intellectual interests
✓ to be admired and admiring
✓ mutual grooming and recognition
✓ to arouse desire
✓ to create a clone of the supervisor
POLITICAL - modernist, functional authoritarian

The relationship is
- unstated but expected
- based on your power and the student’s lack of power (due to social and economic position, status in the university, status in the discipline community, qualifications, gender, ethnicity, age, size, physical characteristics)
- changing over the course of the supervision period as the student acquires knowledge
- leader and follower

The aims are
- to induct the student into the mysteries of the craft
- to develop the student’s power to bask in each other’s glory
- to create an independent but client student
Research Supervision
ANGELA THODY  SUPERVISION MODELS

AUDITING – modernist (bureaucratic)  
post modernism (accountability)

The relationship is
• accountable practice between nominated supervisor and student
• not personal
• auditor to documents
• institutionalised – see whole University Code of Practice
• based on your authority as the university’s appointed supervisor

The aims are to ensure that:
the student completes successfully and on time
all designated processes have been followed and recorded (see Code flow)
all students are treated equally with uniform standards and processes
the university and you are protected and indemnified
the university’s RAE rating improves
Research Supervision
ANGELA THODY SUPERVISION MODELS

INTELLECTUAL Pre-modernist
The relationship is
• Socratic – teacher/pupil, age/youth
• assumed basis of all types of supervisory relationships
• based on your subject and teaching expertise

The aims are to:
provoke students to think
develop contributions to the supervisor’s discipline
enhance supervisor’s and student’s learning
impress the supervisor’s intellectual community
probe subject in depth
INDEPENDENT LEARNING ORIENTED modernist in expected outcome; post modernist in individuality

The relationship is
• mentor/mentee; parent/child
• assumed by supervisor, not so by student
• based on your teacher power
• intended to mature over time

The aims are to ensure freedom for both supervisor and student
student can write and present effectively
student can operate without you
student is prepared for a career
Research Supervision
ANGELA THODY       SUPERVISION MODELS

ORIGINAL/PRAGMATIC
The relationship is
• rarely the same at each meeting
• variable
• based on your personality power
• not sanctioned in university codes of practice
• confusing and exciting

The aims are to
• to surprise intellectually
• let the student find her/his own way
• acquaint the student with the vagaries of life
• help the student to stun the world
Research Supervision
ANGELA THODY     SUPERVISION MODELS

OVERVIEW; MODELS ARE

- EXTREME PROTOTYPES
- UNCONSCIOUSLY SELECTED – SHOULD THEY BE OPENLY DISCUSSED?
- INTENSE
- VARY ACCORDING TO YOUR CHOICE (DOMINANT MODE)
- VARY ACCORDING TO TYPE OF STUDENT – SEE TABLE
1. Role options: from authority to emotion, it’s up to you to set the tone of the relationship – or is it?

_The supervisory relationship is characterised by ‘uncertainty, uniqueness and value conflict’_

- (Acker et al, 1994: 484)

2. Co-creating the supervisory role –

   you and your student

_‘Unless the parameters of both the roles and aims of both supervisor and student are objectively established and genuinely accepted by both, the relationship…will remain fragile, emotional and unbalanced’_ (Baker, 1999:152)
Co-creation:

‘supervision is an intersubjective space in which, when interacting, student and supervisor try to infer mental states and intentions…the space is co-created’ (Grant, 1997:7)
Reasons for non-completion of theses: discussion outcomes

Student’s personality: lack of confidence, lack of stamina, lack of determination, lack of ability, lack of motivation (the supervisor can help improve some of these)

Students feeling: that doctorate is not necessary for their careers; that they are not achieving sufficiently quickly; that they are easily distracted. (supervisor can help with altering these attitudes somewhat)

Students needing intellectual support and management of their studies (the major area for supervisor intervention): lack of data, bad subject choice, writing skills, time management skills, getting started

Students other lives: (supervisors can only offer sympathy - if there is a serious problem, seek expert help – re finance, family, work commitments, health,
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>To what extent</th>
<th>is it ethical to degrade questionnaire data?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How</td>
<td>can you avoid bias as a participant observer?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who</td>
<td>should be included as the subjects for this research?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What</td>
<td>can this article can add to your ideas for the research methodology?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where</td>
<td>have you made searches for your literature?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When</td>
<td>can focus groups be effectively used?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why</td>
<td>have you found it difficult to prepare the chapter I asked for?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Writing is understood as a process in itself:
‘In our experience, it is often through the act of writing that researchers find their way out of the conceptual morass’

Writing improves thinking processes; writing creates ideas; you and the student can see gaps; the student has to start explaining links early on; the students can ‘lodge’ ‘great ideas’; you have something concrete to discuss each tutorial

Writing thus becomes dynamic creativity, a means of discovery and a research method itself, proceeding concurrently with other forms of data collection


And offers endless possibilities for manipulating data presentation, analysis, storage, inserts...
Co-creating the thesis

WHAT DOES DOCTORATENESS NEED?

IDEAS IDEAS IDEAS IDEAS IDEAS IDEAS IDEAS
Conventions Conventions Conventions
perfection perfection perfection perfection

Ideas: contributions to theory, practice and debate
Doctorateness = applying others’ work creatively, creating new understandings, designing/applying new field instruments; generating knowledge; identifying new ideas to investigate; using existing methods in new fields


How best to encourage ideas in a meeting with your student?
Lincoln University Graduate School                      Emeritus Professor Angela Thody

CO-CREATING THE THESIS

Ideas  CONVENTIONS  perfection

- on time and meeting university regulations for format
- lengthy and comprehensive literature review that includes accurate citations
- absolutely correct in vocabulary, punctuation and grammar with no typing errors
- Data collected ethically and rigorously that proves your conclusions
- extensive methodology
- Follows conventional format in layout

ALTERNATIVES: YES IF YOU AND THE SECOND SUPERVISOR AGREE AND YOU ARE SURE YOU CAN FIND A SYMPATHETIC EXTERNAL
CO-CREATING THE THESIS

IDEAS, CONVENTIONS, PERFECTION:

PERFECTION = including academic language, correct English, no colloquialisms etc

SO HOW TO ENCOURAGE CONVENTIONAL PERFECTION (AND STILL ENCOURAGE CREATIVE IDEAS?)
Research Supervision  
A co-created relationship  
ANGELA THODY  
What you need to be able to tell your students...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Who</th>
<th>will help me with interlibrary loans, computer and lab time, health concerns, coping strategies, electronic resource searches.?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What</td>
<td>is a good thesis?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why</td>
<td>is a a good idea to start writing my thesis from day one?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where</td>
<td>will my viva be held?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When</td>
<td>am I expected to complete my proposal (annual progress report, expenses claims); defend my proposal; attend faculty seminars, research methods courses and conferences; finish my thesis and have a viva.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How</td>
<td>do I know when to stop reading for my literature review?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To what extent</td>
<td>Is my research affected by ethical issues?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ASK YOUR STUDENT TO

Set up a file for secondary formats – indirect outputs

e.g. articles, conference papers, posters, books, newspaper items

Ideas go in this file for items that might make smaller outputs with appropriate plans.

List possible journals, collaborators, conferences – go through the data bases together to discuss the best journals for both finding data and for publishing in your field